Sullivan's Island Design Review Board Meeting 21 June 2006

Chairman Pat Ilderton called the meeting to order at 6:06 PM. He stated that the Freedom of Information Act requirements had been met and read the meeting agenda.

Members attending: Pat Ilderton, Steve Herlong, Michael Daly, Billy Craver, Cyndy Ewing and Betty Harmon. Duke Wright did not attend. Kent Prause, Randy Robinson and Kat Kenyon also attended.

Pat Ilderton moved that the 17 May meeting minutes be approved. Steve Herlong moved and Michael Daly seconded to amend the motion to correct an error that indicated Steve Herlong voting on the Smith residence when he had recused himself on the application.

Billy Craver mentioned another error stating that Michael Daly had voted on the Harris residence when he had recused himself and that Steve Herlong had voted on the Ostrover residence when he had recused himself. NOTE: A review of the 17 May 2006 meeting minutes indicate that Michael Daly did not vote on the Harris residence and that Steve Herlong did not voted on the Ostrover residence.

Appropriate changes were made and the minutes were unanimously approved.

Pat Ilderton called for the first application:

Haskins Residence, 2864 Brownell Ave Addition

Kent Prause stated that this was the third time a project to expand the existing residence had been before the board. Pat Ilderton asked the owner to present the revised design.

Elizabeth Haskins said that they were requesting a 19% increase in principal building coverage and 7.35% increase in square footage. The new completed application form indicating proposed increases was provided to board members.

Steve Herlong said that the new design was set back and appeared less massive than an earlier proposal to alter the main structure by enclosing a portion of the second floor porch. Pat Ilderton also commented that this was an improvement over the original design.

Cyndy Ewing asked if there was a justification for the addition. She also asked that if the DRB did not approve the project as submitted could anything else be done. She showed photographs of neighborhood houses and expressed concern about mass of the structure in terms of neighborhood compatibility and said that an addition would make the existing house even more massive. Steve Herlong said that the applicant should be prepared to discuss the reasons they feel the board should grant requested adjustments.

Michael reminded the board that the existing house was constructed prior(to) the passage of the new zoning ordinance that limits the size of new structures.

Betty Harmon said the final design should be brought to the board before approval.

Michael Daly moved and Billy Harmon seconded to approve the application as submitted. Betty Harmon moved and Steve Herlong seconded to amend the first motion to require the applicant to return to the DRB with final drawings. Steve Herlong moved and Billy Craver seconded to amend the amendment to also grant relief of the 2 foot setback requirement on the second floor of the addition.

Pat Ilderton called for a vote to amend the first amendment. Pat Ilderton, Steve Herlong, Michael Daly, Betty Harmon and Billy Craver voted in favor, Cyndy Ewing voted against. The motion was carried. A second vote was called for to amend the original motion. Pat Ilderton, Steve Herlong, Michael Daly, Betty Harmon and Billy Craver voted in favor. Cyndy Ewing voted against. The motion was carried. A third vote was called for on the original motion. Pat Ilderton, Steve Herlong, Michael Daly, Betty Harmon and Billy Craver voted in favor. Cyndy Ewing voted against. The motion carried.

Randy Robinson stated that the second motion provided conceptual approval contingent on the applicant returning with the final design.

Pat Ilderton called for the next application:

Cox Residence, 1807 Atlantic Ave Demolition

An application for demolition of this property was submitted at the 17 May 2006 DRB meeting. Action was deferred until a site visit could be made. Kent Prause stated that members of the DRB had visited the site.

Betty Harmon moved and Cyndy Ewing seconded that the DRB consider adding the structure to the list of historic properties. A discussion took place regarding the process of adding structures to the historic list that is defined in Section 21-94 of the zoning ordinance.

Betty Harmon moved and Cyndy Ewing seconded to amend the original motion to state that the owner had to be provided 30 days written notice if the DRB was going to consider adding the property to the historic property list.

Pat Ilderton called for a vote to amend the original motion. Pat Ilderton, Michael Daly, Betty Harmon and Cyndy Ewing voted in favor. Steve Herlong and Billy Craver voted against.

Pat Ilderton then called on Bill Barr representing the owner.

Bill Barr stated that public notice has to be given for all matters considered for a meeting and that only demolition was stated on the agenda for the 17 May meeting and that it was his understanding that the DRB visit to the site was to determine if the building was suitable for demolition not whether it should be placed on the historic list.

Bill Barr went on to present the case for demolition of the house on the property. He presented photos and asked that the original application be amended to state that the house was non-contributing rather than contributing. He read from Section 21-93 of the zoning ordinance defining a historic structure. He further stated that the house was elevated on concrete block pilings and asbestos siding with additions that are equal or greater than the original structure. He also said that the DRB did not have authority to prohibit demolition.

Kent Prause referred to minutes of the May 2006 meeting and said that the DRB had the right to deny a demolition request and recommend that a property be added to the historic list. Bill Barr said that based on existing circumstances regarding the property today he requests the DRB to move forward with the request for demolition. He went on to state that if the board desired to make this an issue they should have done so in the form of a letter to the applicant.

Kent Prause said that the board needed clarification and advice from legal counsel. The DRB legal counsel was not at the meeting.

Pat Ilderton asked for public comments. There were none.

Cyndy Ewing moved and Betty Harmon seconded to amend the original motion to defer the application so the board could obtain legal advice and assistance from historic preservation professionals.

Pat Ilderton called for a vote to defer the application. Pat Ilderton, Michael Daly, Cyndy Ewing and Betty Harmon voted in favor. Billy Craver and Steve Herlong voted against deferral. The motion to defer was approved.

Pat Ilderton called for the next application:

Dobson & Moses, 2914 I'on Avenue New Construction

Kent Prause stated that this was a new two story elevated structure with Hardi-plank siding and standing seam metal roof. A site plan, floor plans and elevations were submitted with the application. Owners are asking for several increases which the DRB can approve over that allowed in the Zoning Ordinance. Proposed increases are indicated on the DRB Request form submitted with the application.

Ron Denton represented the owners and said the proposed house was similar in mass and scale to others in the neighborhood and that if the requested adjustments were not granted the house would be basically similar in mass and scale.

Pat Ilderton asked for public comments. Betty Driemeyer spoke and presented a petition signed by neighbors who felt the proposed house was to massive for the neighborhood and referred to a new larger house in the area that was constructed before the new zoning ordinance.

Bobby Thompson said that all the neighbors opposed the adjustments and submitted a petition for the record. He asked the DRB to consider the following points:

1) Square footage proposed would make the house incompatible with surrounding houses, 2) Address is incorrect on the plans, 3) Mass and scale is out of proportion with other houses in the neighborhood and enclosed square footage is misstated, 4) Lot size is 105' X 140', 5) The roof is essentially flat and design guidelines state they should be a minimum of 15% slope, and 6) Nine of eleven homes in the neighborhood are owner occupied.

Peter Grimes said the neighbors would like to maintain the character of the island and that the owners gave no justification for the increases they were seeking.

Pat Ilderton read a note from Duke Wright, a DRB member who could not attend the meeting, that he opposed the proposed adjustments. He also read a letter from Lisa and Andrew Crow opposing the adjustments.

Kent Prause and Randy Robinson mentioned a couple of other items regarding second floor setbacks, shape of roofs and square footage relief.

Cyndy Ewing, Steve Herlong, Billy Craver and Betty Harmon each spoke briefly regarding mass and scale, neighborhood compatibility, interest shown by neighbors and how the board wants to hear from neighbors on issues like this.

Betty Harmon moved and Michael Daly seconded to deny the application as submitted and if the owners wanted to return with a scaled down design the DRB would review it.

Ron Denton asked whether the owners would have to return to the board if the design conformed to the Zoning Ordinance. The answer was no.

Pat Ilderton called for a vote on the application. The vote by board members to deny the application as submitted was unanimous.

Pat Ilderton called for the next application:

Ward Lassoe Residence, 2802 Jasper Swimming Pool

Kent Prause stated that the house on the property was a historic structure in a historic district and that he had received necessary information with the application. Randy Robinson said that a four foot fence was proposed to enclose the pool area.

Pat Ilderton asked for public comments. There were none.

Billy Craver moved and Michael Daly seconded to approve the application as submitted. The vote by board members to approve the application was unanimous.

Pat Ilderton called for the next application:

Dawsey Residence, 2850 Jasper Blvd. Modifications to a Historic Structure

Kent Prause stated that the application was for approval to remove a 240 SF addition to the original structure reducing overall size to approximately 915 SF. The owner wants to retain the house which was built in 1850 in its original configuration and use it as an accessory structure. No plans for a second house on the property were received with the application.

Kent said that BZA as well as the DRB would have to act on this proposed action as defined in Section 21-20 of the Zoning Ordinance.

Ron Denton, representing Millie Dawsey, said they would like to remove additions on the left side of the house, restore and upgrade the remaining structure to its original appearance, elevate it about two feet, meet current codes, and reposition the house on the lot. They would like to obtain a C of A from the DRB now to allow them to proceed with work and begin design on the second structure.

Pat Ilderton asked for public comments. David Richardson spoke in opposition to the proposed work. He said that there were discrepancies in the land survey and the house had been where it is for many years and was in harmony with the setback of other houses in the neighborhood. Randy Robinson said that the survey provided with the application was not a legal survey.

Pat Ilderton said the DRB needed to preserve older historic homes and that an addition costing more than 50% of current value would ruin the character of the structure and most likely have to be elevated to meet FEMA flood requirements.

Betty Harmon moved and Cyndy Ewing seconded to defer the application until a legal survey and elevation certificate provided and a site visit made by the board.

Pat Ilderton called for a vote. The vote was unanimous in favor.

Randy Robinson said that the Charleston BAR sometimes advertised and convened meetings at sites so that discussions by the board could take place during the site visit
Board members agreed that was a good way to do it in the future.
Randy Robinson led a discussion about the new application form.
Cyndy Ewing moved to adjourn the meeting. The move was seconded and the vote unanimous to adjourn.

Pat Ilderton Chairman

Duke Wright Secretary