

**Sullivan's Island Design Review Board Meeting
17 January 2007**

Chairman Pat Ilderton called the meeting to order at 5:30 PM at 2101 Pettigrew Street. Members attending were: Pat Ilderton, Steve Herlong, Duke Wright, Cyndy Ewing, Fred Reinhard and Billy Craver. Randy Robinson and Kat Kenyon also attended. Bill Barr and Layne Nelson along with the property owner also attended this portion of the meeting.

Purpose of the meeting at 2101 Pettigrew was to allow the board to inspect the site and house prior to acting on an application submitted in December 2006 to demolish a portion of the structure and because of board discussion in the December meeting to consider adding the house to the list of historic properties.

The meeting reconvened at Town Hall. Clay McCullough and Kent Prause joined the board for this portion of the meeting. Pat Ilderton stated that the Freedom of Information Act requirements had been met and read the agenda.

Pat Ilderton asked for approval of the December 2006 meeting minutes. After discussion approval was postponed until the February meeting.

Pat Ilderton called for the first application:

2101 Pettigrew Street
Partial Demolition of a Historic Property

Steve Herlong recused himself.

Bill Barr, representing the owner, said there were two applications before the board on this property. One for partial demolition and the other for conceptual approval of a design for an addition to the existing house.

In the December 2006 meeting the board voted to consider adding the existing house to the list of historic properties and would be acted upon after a site visit. This item was taken up by the board before moving to the demolition and addition applications.

Bill Barr reminded all that in his opinion the board had to consider and present factual evidence that the property should be added to the historic list. He then wanted to present evidence opposing if the board decided to do so.

The board then discussed whether or not to add the property to the list of historic properties.

Kent Prause stated that the house was currently listed as altered and according to information provided by Cooper Consultants and David Schneider in their assessment an altered structure did not qualify for designation as historic. However, if the DRB, after

evaluation of criteria in the zoning ordinance, determined it met the criteria and voted to add it to the historic list.

In making its decision the board reviewed the eight criteria in Section 21-94 D of the zoning ordinance. Cyndy Ewing said that in her opinion it met at least three of the criteria. Fred Reinhard said he felt it should be added to the list. Pat Ilderton concurred and said the board should allow some latitude in adding square footage. Duke Wright agreed.

Pat Ilderton asked for public comments. There were none.

Cyndy Ewing moved and Fred Reinhard seconded to add the house to the list of historic properties as a Traditional Island Resource. Layne Nelson, representing the owner, said that she had contacted David Schneider and Lisa Felder, another historic consultant, regarding the property. A letter from Lisa Felder was provided for the record. Both consultants concurred that the house had been so altered that it should not be added to the list. A board discussion ensued.

Cyndy Ewing restated her earlier motion to include findings supporting addition of the house to the historic list. Fred Reinhard seconded and added that the house, formally known as the Frampton House, built by Claude Blanchard, meets the following sections of the criteria: (1) has significant inherent character, interest and value as part of the development or heritage of the town, state or nation, (3) is associated with a person or persons who contributed significantly to the culture and town, state or nation, and (7) represents an established and familiar visual feature of the neighborhood or town to warrant designation as a Traditional Island Resource.

The vote was Cyndy Ewing, Duke Wright, Fred Reinhard and Pat Ilderton in favor and Billy Craver against. The motion carried.

The board then received the application for partial demolition.

Kent Prause stated that the ground area of the house is non-conforming.

Layne Nelson, representing the owner discussed three possible options of what might be done. All called for demolition of existing enclosed ground floor space:

- Add a 400 SF third floor addition to the existing structure..
- Add second floor space and connect it to the existing second floor.
- Add second floor space and relocate the existing structure, rotate it 180 degrees, and move it 24 feet towards the street.

Layne presented conceptual plans and said they would like approval to move forward with the third option and presented a conceptual design of proposed work.

Pat Ilderton asked for public comments. Roy Williams, 2513 Ion, said that the proposal would alter the existing structure beyond recognition. He said that it has significant character unique to Sullivan's Island and is part of the overall fabric of the island and work as proposed would demolish an important architectural landmark.

A board discussion ensued. Fred Reinhard moved and Billy Craver seconded to approve demolition of the enclosed ground level portion of the house. Pat Ilderton, Fred Reinhard, Billy Craver and Duke Wright voted in favor. Cyndy Ewing voted against. The motion carried.

Further discussion ensued regarding design of the proposed addition. Duke Wright moved and Fred Reinhard seconded to approve the concept design presented by Layne Nelson contingent on board review of more detailed plans to reduce the mass and scale of the proposed addition. Pat Ilderton, Fred Reinhard, Billy Craver and Duke Wright voted in favor. Cyndy Ewing opposed. The motion carried.

Pat Ilderton called for the next application:

2614 Goldbug Avenue
Demolition of Structure Over 50 Years Old

Kent Prause said that a pending ordinance required that demolition of structures older than 50 years must be approved by the DRB.

Paul Boehm stated that the house, built in 1945, has no historic value.

Pat Ilderton asked for public comments. Tim Reese said that he understood the DRB did not have to approve demolition of a structure less than 50 years old.

Duke Wright noted that the house to be demolished was on a high piece of ground on the property and said that in his opinion anything replacing it should be low profile and consider neighborhood compatibility.

Cyndy Ewing moved and Fred Reinhard seconded that the structure does not meet criteria in Section 21-94 of the zoning ordinance and the request should be approved. The vote was unanimous in favor.

Pat Ilderton called for the next application:

Ostrover Residence, 2263 Atlantic Avenue
New Construction

Steve Herlong recused himself.

Kent Prause stated that the board had previously approved demolition and new construction on this property but because of a dispute over property lines BZA approval had not been granted. The dispute has since been settled.

Jim Henshaw, representing the owner, stated that the DRB had approved a design in May 2006 but because the lot is smaller than initially believed side setback relief was now required. Several design changes were also made that enhance neighborhood compatibility. The house has been narrowed by 2 ft 5 inches and reduced in size to 4,976 SF and moved further back from the street, the beachside deck was reduced to 520 SF, the pool on the deck was enclosed with a vertical wood picket fence, the roof material was changed from copper to zinc alloy covered copper and siding and garage door material configuration was changed.

Pat Ilderton asked for public comments. There were none.

Billy Craver moved and Fred Reinhard seconded to approve the setback adjustments along with the revised plans. The vote was unanimous in favor.

Pat Ilderton called for the next application:

Heidi Brown and Seth Fisher, 405 Station 22
Conceptual Approval for an Addition to a Historic Structure

Kent Prause stated that there were two applications, one for conceptual approval for addition to a historic structure and one for a new house on the same property..

Bill Barr, representing the owners, said they would like the board to review both applications at the same time. The owner already has DRB approval to demolish additions to the historic house and now would like conceptual approval for proposed additions along with approval for construction of new house on the property.

Kent Prause said that the pending ordinance prohibiting reducing the size of a historic structure simply to allow construction of a second structure on the property applied in this instance and if the owner did so a second house could not be constructed. He further stated that in his opinion the board could not entertain an application that would be affected by a pending ordinance and also did not have authority to approve a second structure on the property. The BZA would have to approve that.

A discussion ensued. Bill Barr and Clay McCullough asked to be excused for a private side bar meeting to discuss the pending ordinance.

Upon returning, Clay McCullough stated that in his opinion reducing a historic structure to 1,200 SF for the purpose of qualifying for special exception in order to construct a second house on the property would not be allowed and that the house in question was over 1,200 SF when the pending ordinance took effect. He further said that this was

governed by Section 21-20 C (2) (b) of the zoning ordinance and the application could not be heard at this time.

Bill Barr said that he wanted the record to reflect that he respectively disagrees with Clay McCullough's opinion.

Pat Ilderton then called for the application to renovate and add on to the historic structure.

Heidi Brown said that she was coming before the board with two plans because she was unsure of the direction they would be allowed to proceed. One plan is to improve, enlarge and elevate the existing historic structure. The other plan is to leave the historic structure as it is except for previously DRB approved demolition of later additions.

The question in her mind was would the board and town prefer that the historic structure be preserved in place (after approved demolition of later additions) as an important island landmark and allow a second structure on the property or have to historic structure improved, enlarged and elevated to meet FEMA requirements? She further said that if they were not allowed to proceed with a second structure they would like conceptual approval to enlarge the historic house and elevate it to two feet above the FEMA requirement in order to allow under house parking.

Pat O'Neil, representing the town council, said that the DRB would be asked to develop criteria for council consideration that would allow the board to make discretionary judgments regarding application of the 1,200 SF rule..

After discussion the applicant withdrew the applications.

Pat Ilderton called for the next application:

Harris Residence, 1891 Iron Street
Design Change on Previously Approved Application

Kent Prause said the application was of relocate front steps and change porch railings.

Justin Ferrick, representing the owner, said they would now like to leave the steps on the front of the porch as opposed to the side and change railings to a horizontal design.

Pat Ilderton asked for public comments. There were none.

Billy Craver moved and Duke Wright seconded to approve the application as submitted. Pat Ilderton, Billy Craver, Duke Wright and Steve Herlong voted in favor. Cyndy Ewing voted against. The motion carried.

Pat Ilderton called for the next application:

Baldwin Residence, 1808 Central Avenue
New Construction in a Historic District

Steve Herlong recused himself.

Sabrina Cochran, representing the owner, presented a preliminary design and said they were asking for preliminary approval and would return to the board with more detailed plans. She said that neighborhood compatibility was a key factor in the design and that the house profile would be kept as low as possible, with a front porch and rear deck, doors and windows that compliment the neighborhood, side elevation requirements would meet criteria, and a finished first floor 7 ½ feet above grade.

Pat Ilderton asked for public comments. There were none.

Duke Wright moved and Fred Reinhard seconded that the submitted materials list and plans be approved. A vote in favor was unanimous.

Pat Ilderton called for the next application:

Zoukis Residence, 1908 Middle Street
Landscape Plans and Changes to a Previously Approved Application

Kent Prause stated that two applications were submitted for this property. The first was for a landscape plan and the other for after-the-fact review of major changes made to previously approved plans for a new house on the property.

The Landscape Plan was presented first. Kent Prause directed the board's attention to Section 21-41 of the zoning ordinance regarding landscape design and plantings. Randy Robinson said that the only thing the DRB needed to approve on the landscape plan was the stucco knee wall and fence.

Cantrell Belcher, representing Rhodes/Haskins, the builder and the owner, reviewed the landscape plan in detail.

Sammy Rhodes presented the second application and described in detail changes that had been made. The most significant change was a reversal (mirroring) of the entire house on the lot in order to save an existing 40 foot live oak tree from potential damage. Other changes included a larger swimming pool, a changed stairway from the deck, and changes to the south elevation design. He also presented petition signed by 24 neighbors who did not object to the larger size pool and felt the landscaping plan would enhance the neighborhood. After considerable discussion the board Okayed the larger pool.

Pat Ilderton asked for public comments. There were none.

Fred Reinhard moved and Duke Wright seconded to approve mirroring of the house only. A vote was unanimous in favor.

Further discussion ensued regarding the other changes. It was decided that the owner should resubmit the application defining all changes from the original approved submission and request after the fact approval. Billy Craver moved and Fred Reinhard seconded to defer this application. A vote to defer was unanimous.

The meeting was adjourned at 9:30 PM.

Pat Ilderton, Chairman

Duke Wright, Secretary