

0001

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9

MEETING OF THE SULLIVAN'S ISLAND DESIGN REVIEW BOARD

10

DATE: June 16, 2010

11

TIME: 6:00 p.m.

12

LOCATION: SULLIVAN'S ISLAND TOWN HALL
1610 Middle Street
Sullivan's Island, SC 29482

13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22

23

REPORTED BY: NANCY ENNIS TIERNEY, CSR (IL)
CLARK & ASSOCIATES
P.O. Box 73129
North Charleston, SC 29415
(843) 762-6294

24

25

0002

1

A P P E A R A N C E S

2
3

DESIGN REVIEW BOARD MEMBERS:

4

5

PAT ILBERTON - Chair
STEPHEN HERLONG - Vice Chair

6

BETTY HARMON - Member
FRED REINHARD - Member

7

JON LANCTO - Member
BILLY CRAVER - Member

8
9

10

ALSO PRESENT: Kat Kenyon - Permit Licensing

11
12
13
14
15

16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
0003

1 MR. ILDERTON: This is the June 16th, 2010,
2 meeting of the Sullivan's Island Design Review Board.
3 It is now 6:00. Members in attendance are Pat Ilderton,
4 and Steve Herlong, and Betty Harmon, and Fred Reinhard,
5 and Jon Lancto and Billy Craver

6 MS. HARMON: We like you anyway.

7 MR. ILDERTON: And the Freedom of
8 Information requirements have been met for this meeting.
9 The items -- the first item on tonight's agenda is the
10 approval of the May 2010 minutes.

11 MR. CRAVER: So moved.

12 MR. ILDERTON: Second?

13 MS. HARMON: Did you make corrections --

14 MS. KENYON: Did you see her sheet? It's
15 further down, further back. What you wrote is further
16 back, like 12 pages. It's in there.

17 COURT REPORTER: It's on Page 24.

18 MS. HARMON: It's what?

19 COURT REPORTER: On Page 24.

20 MS. HARMON: That I wrote?

21 MS. KENYON: Uh-huh. Almost word for word
22 what you wrote is on Page 24.

23 MS. HARMON: Well, mine wasn't on Page 24.
24 What page did I say it was on?

25 MS. KENYON: 12.

0004

1 MS. HARMON: 12. Well, did I get a wrong
2 copy or something? Well, anyway, I will look at it
3 before I approve it.

4 MR. ILDERTON: Everybody in favor?

5 MR. HERLONG: Aye.

6 MR. ILDERTON: Aye.

7 MR. REINHARD: Aye.

8 MR. LANCTO: Aye.

9 MR. CRAVER: Aye.

10 MR. ILDERTON: Anybody opposed?

11 MS. HARMON: I'm abstaining.

12 MR. ILDERTON: All right. So 1456 Thompson
13 Avenue, new construction.

14 MR. HERLONG: I'm recusing myself.

15 (Mr. Herlong recused himself for 1456
16 Thompson Avenue application.)

17 MR. ILDERTON: All right. And Randy is not

18 here, right?

19 MS. KENYON: He's not here. That's correct.

20 MR. ILBERTON: So we don't need any -- this
21 has already been before us several times, a couple of
22 times.

23 Yes, sir?

24 MR. HEINLEN: Rodd Heinlen with Steve
25 Herlong's office. We are here representing the Kellys
0005

1 and asking for final approval on their house at 1456
2 Thompson.

3 We were here last February and received
4 conceptual and preliminary approval at that time. We
5 asked for several things and received relief on the
6 following.

7 We got relief of 3.75 feet at front
8 setback, relief of 5 feet at side setback, relief of
9 side setback at the second floor, relief of an
10 additional 199 square feet for the principal building
11 coverage, relief of an additional 715 square feet for
12 the principal building square footage, relief of
13 additional 2 feet for the principal building on the side
14 facade. That's all.

15 MR. ILBERTON: Great.

16 MR. HEINLEN: Basically the house is the
17 same. We haven't changed anything on the street facade.
18 We have adjusted some of the windows because of what was
19 happening on the inside, mostly on the two side
20 elevations.

21 One of the things that we changed that
22 Betty brought up the last time was changing the front
23 entry stairs to a cable railing instead of the pickets.

24 MS. HARMON: It looks much better, much
25 better. Thank you.

0006

1 MR. HEINLEN: Sure. On the back side we had
2 this stair coming straight out. We did a switchback
3 stair. We changed the gable ends to a board and batten
4 to break up that end. Basically, that's it.

5 We have just started with some
6 conceptual landscape architecture, and there is some
7 discussion on the water side of changing the outdoor
8 stair to the other side. If you will recall, that is
9 the stair we are talking about.

10 There is a shed here with a common wall
11 that has to remain on the property line. We are
12 thinking that the general flow coming back into the
13 backyard is going to be this way, and that this might be
14 a problem, so we are thinking of changing this over to
15 this side.

16 MS. HARMON: Okay. Is that the garage or is
17 that the --

18 MR. HEINLEN: That's the garage right here.

19 MS. HARMON: And there is a building -- on

20 the other side there is a greenhouse?
21 MR. HEINLEN: A shed, yes.
22 MS. HARMON: Yes. Is that what you are
23 talking about removing?
24 MR. HEINLEN: Well, there is a common wall,
25 and so that wall has to stay, and we were always going
0007
1 to remove the shed.
2 MS. HARMON: The greenhouse is what I'm
3 calling it, the glassed in --
4 MR. HEINLEN: Part of it is a greenhouse,
5 yes.
6 MS. HARMON: Yes. Okay. All right. That
7 is a wonderful greenhouse. Being a gardener, I
8 appreciate that.
9 MR. HEINLEN: So if we could work that out
10 with Randy on the flip of the stair, you know. Kelly
11 Messiaeu (phonetic) is doing that design work, and we
12 are just not sure where that's going.
13 Other than that, I know Jon brought up
14 the foundation height we were talking about. We were
15 able to get the duct work in the second floor system for
16 the first floor, so we made that by a few inches so we
17 are okay on that.
18 So I think that's all. I mean, it's
19 basically the same, with a few minor modifications.
20 MR. ILDERTON: Great. Thank you. Is there
21 any public comment to this application? Public comment
22 section is closed. And Randy has no other comments, I
23 see. So, Billy?
24 MR. CRAVER: I think it's fine. I don't
25 have a problem with them flipping the stairs over to the
0008
1 other side if they want to, so I'm fine with it.
2 MR. ILDERTON: Jon?
3 MR. LANCTO: Yeah. I would just say when we
4 make a motion we ought to include that as either/or.
5 I'm fine with it, though.
6 MR. ILDERTON: Fred?
7 MR. REINHARD: Normally I would say I don't
8 understand why we have to go 700 square feet over what
9 the code requires, but this house is so nicely
10 articulated with quite large porches front and rear, and
11 cramming that second floor into, essentially, the roof
12 with dormers, making it a story and a half, you really
13 have done a remarkable job of getting almost 3,500
14 square feet out of a house that looks like it's
15 2,500 square feet, so I'm okay with it.
16 So it just goes to show you that with
17 good architecture, I guess the allowances that we have
18 can actually be prudently utilized by good architects.
19 MR. ILDERTON: Good. Betty?
20 MS. HARMON: I like it, and I think the
21 changes you have made are fine, and I appreciate you

22 changing the structure to rails, and so I'm fine with
23 it.

24 MR. ILDERTON: I am also fine with the
25 application, so do I hear a motion?

0009

1 MR. CRAVER: I move we approve it, give
2 final approval to the plans, and that is allowing them
3 to switch the rear stairs to the other side or leave
4 them the way they are.

5 MR. ILDERTON: Do I hear a second?

6 MR. LANCTO: Second.

7 MR. ILDERTON: Discussion? Everybody in
8 favor?

9 MR. HERLONG: Aye.

10 MR. ILDERTON: Aye.

11 MS. HARMON: Aye.

12 MR. REINHARD: Aye.

13 MR. LANCTO: Aye.

14 MR. CRAVER: Aye.

15 MR. ILDERTON: Great. Thank you, sir.

16 MR. HEILEN: Thank you.

17 MS. HARMON: Can I tell you before you
18 leave, I was there today on the right-hand side facing
19 the marsh from the house, as you are facing the house,
20 those two ducts that are coming out at the bottom, there
21 is cold air coming out of there, out of those two ducts.

22 MR. HEINLEN: Oh, on their house now?

23 MS. HARMON: Yes.

24 MR. HEINLEN: Oh, really?

25 MS. HARMON: It's the air-conditioning

0010

1 coming out.

2 MR. HEILEN: Yeah, I know they are not over
3 there. They use the dock over there occasionally when
4 some friends come into town. But I will -- we are going
5 to meet with them tomorrow, I think, so I will tell
6 them.

7 MS. HARMON: Please tell them that, because
8 I'm sure it's costing them money.

9 MR. HEINLEN: Okay. Thank you.

10 MR. CRAVER: And it's not helping.

11 MS. HARMON: It's not helping. It felt
12 good, though, when I walked by. I'm like, oh, this
13 feels nice.

14 MR. CRAVER: Nice try, but it ain't working.

15 MR. ILDERTON: 2523 I'on Avenue, alteration.
16 And Randy does have some comments on this application.

17 Are you going to read them?

18 MS. KENYON: Yes.

19 MR. ILDERTON: Great. Thank you.

20 MS. KENYON: This is designated as a
21 historic resource Number 120, but in the '90s Joel
22 Wolfe did extensive altering and raised it.

23 They are requesting a second floor

24 addition to include a bedroom, a bath and a closet.
25 Also included in the application is to enclose an
0011

1 existing entry porch on the rear of the structure.

2 The second floor addition will be
3 accomplished by adding shed dormers to the front and
4 rear of the existing structure. There are no extensions
5 beyond the existing footprints. So they are going to
6 stay within the footprint of the house.

7 MR. ILDERTON: Great. Thank you. Yes,
8 ma'am?

9 MS. SILVERMAN: Well, we have been in the
10 house seven years, and we took out a volleyball court
11 that I don't know if you-all remember was in the front
12 yard. And I think we have improved it.

13 And the architect that did the design --
14 this is a master bedroom that we wanted to put upstairs.
15 All the windows will open, and they sort of replicate
16 the old windows and the old doors on the front porch as
17 it is now, and so it will look like a sleeping porch
18 kind of look.

19 My architect, he couldn't be here
20 tonight, he's in Atlanta, is also a friend and on the
21 Board of the National Historic Trust, so he's very
22 sensitive to keeping the flavor of the house and the
23 neighborhood, and he's been here many times. He's
24 crawled around in my attic. He has crawled around under
25 the house. And knows exactly where the original house
0012

1 stopped and started.

2 And he said it won't be intrusive at
3 all. It won't look looming, it's just a room. And the
4 back porch is just a portion of the back porch that we
5 wanted to put the laundry room, move it out of the
6 kitchen. It's not the whole -- it's just a little back
7 porch. I don't know if you can tell from that design.

8 But that was just an option he threw in
9 when we drew up the upstairs bedroom, because he said
10 maybe you better start thinking about asking about that
11 now if that is going to be a consideration.

12 If the second floor is too expensive,
13 then we will remodel the kitchen. So we may not do that
14 if we can do the second floor, or the room upstairs.
15 But he is sensitive when we tried to -- you know, I grew
16 up on the island during the summer. My mother, who is
17 94, spent her childhood summers here. And my
18 grandparents' house is still in the family, and it's at
19 Station 26. It's the corner of 26th and I'on.

20 MR. ILDERTON: Great. Thank you, ma'am. I
21 guess there is no other comments from Randy?

22 MS KENYON: No.

23 MR. ILDERTON: Is there any public comment
24 to this application? No public comment. The public
25 comment section is closed.

0013

1 Steve, do you want to start off?

2 MR. HERLONG: I think it's -- it is a house
3 that has gone through extensive alterations in the past,
4 although it's on the historic list. It has got great
5 character. It fits in the neighborhood with a lot of
6 character.

7 The most visible change that anybody is
8 going to see is the addition of shed dormers, which is
9 going to blend very well within the community. I don't
10 see any problem at all with the proposed changes.

11 I believe you have submitted it as a
12 conceptual design at this point. You know, we can move
13 it further towards preliminary or do whatever we want.
14 It might be something the board might discuss. But I
15 have no trouble with it. I think it's fine.

16 MR. ILBERTON: Betty?

17 MS. HARMON: Thank you. I walked around
18 that today several times looking at that little
19 community, and the photographs are very helpful because
20 you could relate to each one.

21 I guess my -- what is the total height
22 going to be of the house?

23 MS. SILVERMAN: Well, is that on the --

24 MR. ILBERTON: It looks like it's 30 feet,
25 right at 30.

0014

1 MS. HARMON: Where is it?

2 MR. ILBERTON: It's on the elevation, the
3 new -- the add on the second floor.

4 MS. HARMON: Oh, okay. I missed that.

5 MR. ILBERTON: It's 25 now.

6 MS. HARMON: It's 25 now and it's going to
7 be 31?

8 MR. ILBERTON: 30. It says 29.5.

9 MS. SILVERMAN: I was talking to the
10 architect earlier and he's available. He said I could
11 call him at home. But he said it would be just about
12 four feet, three to four in that area of the roof where
13 it will be. It's not the whole second floor.

14 MS. HARMON: Well, I think the density will
15 fit in with the other houses because it's not going to
16 be too high. I think you have a problem if you are
17 sticking it way up and then try to put it in. So I
18 think it will fit nicely in the community and I'm okay
19 with it.

20 MR. ILBERTON: Fred?

21 MR. REINHARD: Well, I have a real dilemma
22 with this application because it is a house that was
23 built in 1895, although I realize that it has been
24 raised up, which definitely changes the proportions of
25 the house and keeps it from looking like a classic

0015

1 Sullivan's Island beach house. It's been contemporized

2 in that respect, but I understand why.

3 The roof line and the porches are the
4 thing that are most original to the house, and I kind of
5 think that adding dormers to that roof line changes it
6 very significantly and takes away some of the historic
7 composition of the house.

8 I particularly don't like the use of
9 contemporary casement windows in a house that
10 traditionally had, it looks like, 8/8 double-hung
11 windows, so I'm not going to vote in favor of this.

12 MR. ILDERTON: Jon?

13 MR. LANCTO: I am kind of on the same page
14 as Fred on this, that the dormers -- the number of
15 windows spread across that section seems out of scale
16 with the rest of the house. It seems to me that it
17 should be more of a spaced -- less use of windows in
18 those dormers to make the dormer fit better with the
19 house.

20 I don't mind the shed dormer at all.
21 It's just the number of windows that are spread across
22 that dormer. And, of course, as Fred says, that they
23 are casement windows instead of double-hung windows. So
24 I have a little bit of a problem with that aspect of it.

25 MR. ILDERTON: Billy?

0016

1 MR. CRAVER: I am probably going to shock my
2 fellow board members. I agree with you, Jon. I am okay
3 with the addition. I just think that the windows,
4 having seven casement windows going across there looks
5 out of place.

6 I mean, if there were, I don't know,
7 three or four and they were double-hung and looked like
8 island windows, then I think they would be in character
9 with the house. I can live with the addition, but I'm
10 not sure with the Florida element of it.

11 MR. ILDERTON: Great. Thank you.

12 Well, there might be some compromise
13 available if the style of the casements were changed.
14 And maybe -- I guess what a lot of folks are objecting
15 to is the mass of the dormer, and maybe it could be
16 split up into two dormers with less windows or
17 something, but still have plenty of view, view and
18 ventilation, which is really what you want, what I guess
19 you are trying to achieve up there.

20 MS. SILVERMAN: Could I say something?

21 MR. ILDERTON: Yes, ma'am.

22 MS. SILVERMAN: Do you-all have this
23 drawing?

24 MR. ILDERTON: I think so.

25 MR. CRAVER: Yes. It's like that.

0017

1 MR. HERLONG: It's a smaller version of
2 that.

3 MS. SILVERMAN: Oh, okay.

4 MR. CRAVER: I don't mind -- we are looking
5 at one dormer. I think that the casement windows,
6 having it be a whole wall of windows, is a little out of
7 character.

8 MS. SILVERMAN: When he explained the design
9 to me he said it was to not replicate, but the old doors
10 and the old windows on the porch, which are the only
11 original windows, are 2/2 like this, the doors and
12 the -- this whole thing Joel added, and those are, you
13 know, new windows. The old windows are on the porch,
14 which I guess you can't see, but they look like that
15 more than that.

16 MR. ILBERTON: Well, as I say, there may be
17 some ways that we could give direction to the applicant
18 and not just deny it out of hand, but deny it with -- or
19 maybe suggest that they -- what happens if we just deny
20 it out of hand as far as reapplying?

21 MR. HERLONG: You can reapply any time.

22 MR. ILBERTON: Okay. But some ad -- I mean,
23 would we want discussion about what adjustments might be
24 acceptable or --

25 MS. HARMON: I think that would be a good

0018

1 way to give her a lead as to what we want.

2 MR. ILBERTON: What would that --

3 MR. HERLONG: I have to say, I tend to agree
4 with some of the comments of the board. The casement
5 windows with the right patterns could look okay, but I
6 tend to think there are -- I missed that, but there are
7 already so many more original -- the double-hung windows
8 I think would look more appropriate, and maybe some
9 study of breaking up that dormer would be a good idea.

10 MR. ILBERTON: On the Atlantic Street side.

11 MR. HERLONG: I tend to agree with those
12 comments.

13 MR. ILBERTON: So, I mean, you could really
14 achieve the same -- basically the same need of square
15 footage by just some visual adjustments of the structure
16 itself and still, basically, have a second floor bedroom
17 and bath with some adjustments in there.

18 I mean, I think we are saying probably
19 it would be more -- it would be looked on more favorably
20 if those adjustments were made, and we are saying with
21 the double-hung windows and possibly breaking up the
22 front shed dormer.

23 Now, that might not get everybody on the
24 same page, everybody on this board on the same page, but
25 it might get enough people to essentially be a

0019

1 favorable -- be in your favor. So it may not take much
2 at all to get what you hope to achieve out of that
3 square footage.

4 MR. CRAVER: So, Jon, on the side that has
5 seven, if it were four instead of seven, and on the

6 other side instead of nine it were five, that would work
7 for me.

8 I would rather see a double hung look
9 that is more of a Sullivan's Island traditional look for
10 a house this age. I mean, I don't have a problem with
11 the dormer staying the size it is. It's the solid wall
12 of windows that just doesn't look right.

13 MR. ILDERTON: The casement windows.

14 MR. CRAVER: Yeah.

15 MR. REINHARD: What happens is it begins --
16 because it has grown, and because of the number of
17 casement units, it transitions from being a dormer to a
18 monitor.

19 It looks like -- and this is not an
20 insult. It looks like a monitor that you might find on
21 top of an industrial building that is used to catch
22 light and bring the air down inside to the building.
23 It's because it's long, and it's not very high and it's
24 all glass, and it doesn't work with this beautiful beach
25 house, I don't think.

0020

1 MR. ILDERTON: Do I hear a motion?

2 MR. REINHARD: Can we defer it? Is that --

3 MR. ILDERTON: We can defer it.

4 MR. REINHARD: Well, I would move for
5 deferral. And hopefully the architect will understand
6 our -- we will get a copy of our minutes -- and
7 understand our comments and go back and use his
8 expertise as a historic architect to come up with
9 something that is more palatable to this board.

10 MR. LANCTO: I think that you could make
11 some minor changes and make this more in character with
12 the rest of the house and come back for a final and have
13 a really good chance of getting approval on it.

14 MR. CRAVER: I will second the motion.

15 MR. ILDERTON: I assume we have a motion on
16 the floor for deferment. Any more discussion on that
17 motion? Everybody in favor?

18 MR. HERLONG: Aye.

19 MR. ILDERTON: Aye.

20 MS. HARMON: Aye.

21 MR. REINHARD: Aye.

22 MR. LANCTO: Aye.

23 MR. CRAVER: Aye.

24 MR. ILDERTON: Great. Thank you, ma'am.

25 Do we have staff issues?

0021

1 MS. KENYON: No.

2 MR. ILDERTON: Okay. We are adjourned.

3 (The hearing was concluded at 6:24 p.m.)

4 - - -

5

6

7

8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
0022

1 STATE OF SOUTH CAROLINA)
2)
3 COUNTY OF CHARLESTON)

4 I, Nancy Ennis Tierney, Certified Shorthand Reporter
5 and Notary Public for the State of South Carolina at
6 Large, do hereby certify that said hearing was taken at
7 the time and location therein stated; that the hearing
8 was recorded stenographically by me and were thereafter
9 transcribed by computer-aided transcription; and that
10 the foregoing is a full, complete and true record of the
11 hearing.

12 I certify that I am neither related to nor counsel
13 for any party to the cause pending or interested in the
14 events thereof.

15 Witness my hand, I have hereunto affixed my official
16 seal this 29th day of June, 2010, at Charleston,
17 Charleston County, South Carolina.

18
19
20
21
22
23

24 _____
25 Nancy Ennis Tierney
CSR (IL)
My Commission expires
April 6, 2014